UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT District of Maine

Plaintiff,) vs. Civil No. 02-183-E) CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS) COMPANY, Defendant/Third-Party) Plaintiff,) vs.	
CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS) COMPANY,) Defendant/Third-Party) Plaintiff,)	
COMPANY,) Defendant/Third-Party) Plaintiff,)	}-S
Defendant/Third-Party) Plaintiff,)	
Plaintiff,)	
vs.)	
)	
BARRETT PAVING MATERIALS, INC.,)	
et al.,)	
Third-party Defendants)	

ORDER AFFIRMING THE RECOMMENDED DECISION OF THE MAGISTRATE JUDGE

The United States Magistrate Judge filed with the Court on July 6, 2004 her Recommended Decision (Docket #381). Defendant Citizens Communications Company filed its objection to the Recommended Decision on July 23, 2004 (Docket #386 and #391) and Plaintiff City of Bangor filed its response to Defendant's objection on August 9, 2004 (Docket #398). Defendant Citizens Communications Company has also filed a request for oral argument (Docket #387 and #392) pursuant to Local Rule 7(f).

I have reviewed and considered the Magistrate Judge's Recommended Decision, together with the entire record; I have made a de novo determination of all matters adjudicated by the

Magistrate Judge's Recommended Decision; and I concur with the recommendations of the United States Magistrate Judge for the reasons set forth in her Recommended Decision, and determine that no further proceeding is necessary.

- 1. It is therefore <u>ORDERED</u> that the Recommended Decision of the Magistrate Judge is hereby AFFIRMED.
- 2. Defendant Citizens Communications Company's Motion for Setting Hearing and Oral Argument (Docket #387 and #392) is DENIED.
- 3. Defendant Citizens Communications Company's Motion for Summary Judgment (Docket #315) is GRANTED IN PART, by entering JUDGMENT in favor of Citizens on Counts IX and XII (private nuisance claims), XIII (strict liability/ultra-hazardous activity), and XVI (punitive damages) of the City's Second Amended Complaint (Docket #175).

/s/ George Z. Singal Chief U.S. District Judge

Dated this 14th day of October 2004.

BANGOR, CITY OF

represented by W. SCOTT LASETER

MCKENNA, LONG & ALDRIDGE 303 PEACHTREE STREET, NE SUITE 5300 ATLANTA, GA 30308 (404) 527-4000 Email: slaseter@mckennalong.com LEAD ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

WILLIAM B. DEVOE EATON PEABODY P. O. BOX 1210

BANGOR, ME 4402-1210 947-0111

Email: wdevoe@eatonpeabody.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

P. ANDREW HAMILTON

EATON PEABODY P. O. BOX 1210 BANGOR, ME 4402-1210 947-0111

Email: ahamilton@eatonpeabody.com

CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY

JAY C. JOHNSON

MAYER, BROWN, ROWE & MAW 1909 K STREET, N.W. WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1101 202-263-3000

Email:

jcjohnson@mayerbrownrowe.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE

FRIEDMAN, GAYTHWAITE, WOLF & LEAVITT SIX CITY CENTER P. O. BOX 4726 PORTLAND, ME 4112-4726 761-0900 Email: mgaythwaite@fgwl-law.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BRUCE W. HEPLER

FRIEDMAN, GAYTHWAITE, WOLF & LEAVITT
SIX CITY CENTER
P. O. BOX 4726
PORTLAND, ME 4112-4726
(207) 761-0900
Email: bhepler@fgwl-law.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN

MAYER, BROWN, ROWE & MAW 1909 K STREET, N.W. WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1101 (202) 263-3000 Email: jhahn@mayerbrownrowe.com

JULIE ANNA POTTS

MAYER, BROWN, ROWE & MAW 1909 K STREET, N.W. WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1101 202/263-3370

JOHN P. MCVEIGH

PRETI, FLAHERTY, BELIVEAU, PACHIOS & HALEY, LLC PO BOX 9546 PORTLAND, ME 04112-9546

represented by

PORTLAND, ME 04112-9546 791-3000

Fax: 791-3111

Email: jmcveigh@preti.com LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

DAVID B. VAN SLYKE

PRETI, FLAHERTY, BELIVEAU, PACHIOS & HALEY, LLC ONE CITY CENTER PO BOX 9546 PORTLAND, ME 04101-9546 791-3000

BARRETT PAVING MATERIALS INC

Email: dvanslyke@preti.com

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

UNITED STATES ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS

JOHN H. DE YAMPERT, JR.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE TORTS BRANCH, CIVIL DIVISION PO BOX 14271 WASHINGTON, DC 20044-4271 (202) 616-4022 Email: john.deyampert@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY

STEPHEN E. CROWLEY

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE ENVIRONMENTAL & NATURAL RESOURCES DIVISION ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE SECTION P.O. BOX 23986 WASHINGTON, DC 20026-3986 202-514-0165 Email: stephen.crowley@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHELLE T. DELEMARRE

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE P.O. BOX 14271 WASHINGTON, DC 20044-4271 (202) 616-4037 Email: michelle.delemarre@usdoj.gov ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHARLES A. HARVEY, JR.

HARVEY & FRANK TWO CITY CENTER P.O. BOX 126 PORTLAND, ME 4112 207-775-1300

represented by

DEAD RIVER COMPANY

Email: harvey@harveyfrank.com *LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

ROBERT S. FRANK

HARVEY & FRANK
TWO CITY CENTER
P.O. BOX 126
PORTLAND, ME 4112
207-775-1300

Email: frank@harveyfrank.com ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FRANCIS G. KELLEHER

GOODWIN, PROCTOR & HOAR EXCHANGE PLACE 53 STATE STREET

represented by BOSTON, MA 2109-2881

617-570-1000

Email: fkelleher@goodwinprocter.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

GREGORY A. BIBLER

GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP EXCHANGE PLACE BOSTON, MA 02109 (617) 570-1000 Email: gbibler@goodwinprocter.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

SEAN MAHONEY

VERRILL & DANA
1 PORTLAND SQUARE
P.O. BOX 586
PORTLAND, ME 04112
(207) 774-4000
Email: smahoney@verrilldana.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

HONEYWELL INTERNATIONAL INC

ROBERT L. BRENNAN

GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP

EXCHANGE PLACE

BOSTON, MA 02109

(617) 570-1000

Email: rbrennan@goodwinprocter.com

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

DOUGLAS A. GRAUEL

NELSON, KINDER, MOSSEAU &

SATURLEY, P.C.

99 MIDDLE STREET

represented by MANCHESTER, NH 03101

603-647-1800

Email: dgrauel@nkms.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JAY VARON

FOLEY & LARDNER

3000 K STREET NORTHWEST

WASHINGTON, DC 20007

(202) 672-5300

Email: jvaron@foleylaw.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

E. TUPPER KINDER

NELSON, KINDER, MOSSEAU &

SATURLEY, P.C.

99 MIDDLE STREET

MANCHESTER, NH 03101

(603) 647-1800

JEFFREY A. THALER

BERNSTEIN, SHUR, SAWYER, &

represented by NELSON

100 MIDDLE STREET

P.O. BOX 9729

UGI UTILITIES INC

BEAZER EAST INC

CENTERPOINT ENERGY

RESOURCES CORP

PORTLAND, ME 4104-5029

207-774-1200

Email: jthaler@bssn.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHARLES T. WEHLAND

JONES, DAY

77 WEST WACKER DRIVE

SUITE 3500

represented by CHICAGO, IL 60601-1692

312-782-3939

Email: ctwehland@jonesday.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

DAVID S. SHERMAN, JR

DRUMMOND, WOODSUM &

MACMAHON

245 COMMERCIAL ST.

P.O. BOX 9781

PORTLAND, ME 04104

207-772-1941

Fax: 207-772-3627

Email: dshermanecf@dwmlaw.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ALBERT D. STURTEVANT

JONES, DAY

77 WEST WACKER DRIVE

SUITE 3500

CHICAGO, IL 60601-1692

312-782-3939

Email: adsturtevant@jonesday.com

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAURA M. EARL

JONES, DAY

77 WEST WACKER DRIVE

SUITE 3500

CHICAGO, IL 60601-1692

312-782-3939

Email: learl@jonesday.com *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

ROBINSON SPEIRS, JR

KEVIN M. CUDDY

CUDDY & LANHAM

470 EVERGREEN WOODS

BANGOR, ME 4401

represented by

(207) 942-2898

Email: kmc@cuddylanham.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JULIE ANN MACMANNIS

KEVIN M. CUDDY

represented by

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NANCY S DAWSON

KEVIN M. CUDDY

represented by

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ELIZABETH H SPEIRS

KEVIN M. CUDDY

represented by

(See above for address) *LEAD ATTORNEY*

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARY S PRICE

KEVIN M. CUDDY

represented by

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBINSON SPEIRS

KEVIN M. CUDDY

represented by (Se

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED